Planning Dilemmas

11.201 GATEWAY: Planning Action

Xavier de Souza Briggs

Lecture 3

Today's agenda

- **Classics on the role and politics of planning**
  - Core concepts
  - Comparative perspective
- **Key dilemmas in practice**

Classics

- **Advocacy planning (Davidoff)**
- **Muddling through (Lindblom)**
- **Comprehensive rational planning vs. incrementalism and bargaining (Altshuler)**
- **The place of planning—everything vs. nothing (Wildavsky)**

Comparative perspectives

Some organizing dimensions:

- **"Cultures" of planning: Paths of history, deep assumptions, practice norms**

- **Government-market-civil society relations, institutional roles**

- **Centralized vs. decentralized authority**

- **Legitimacy—of knowledge <u>and</u> action in specific contexts (frames, narratives)**

Key Dilemmas (Gateway focus)

- **Place and society: The power and limits of physical design**
- **Unleashing vs. taming the market**
- **Planning from "above" vs. "below"**
- **Planning knowledge: Trained professional vs. "indigenous" experts**
- **Comprehensiveness vs. incrementalism**
- **The role of identity**

Power and limits of physical design

- **Physical design as a tool for enhancing well-being**

- **Can it also enhance *equity*, i.e. address inequities?**

- **What "social needs" are uniquely addressed by design interventions?**

- **How to address a diversity of users/publics?**

- **Culture and values: What's culturally determined? How are meanings attached to space? What does design assume about "community"?**

Unleashing vs. taming the market

- **Challenges in addressing market *failures***
- **Styles of *regulation*: command-and-control vs. other**
- **Taming vs. "triggering" markets**
- **The market as a system of *accountability*—improving performance through consumer choices—not as "business" or profit motive**

Planning from above vs. below

- **Rights, accountability, and power**
- **The promise of citizen involvement vs. the risk of cronyism, parochialism, process paralysis (impasse)**
- **Civil society and government interaction: Competing, collaborating, contesting, other?**
- **Globalization: Transnational coalitions, media influence, information technology shifts in power and voice**

Trained vs. indigenous experts

- **What forms of knowledge are *valid*? Who sets the rules?**

- **What does public participation add to what technical experts provide?**

- **How can distinct types of expertise be *blended* to create better, not just more popular, solutions?**

- **Technocratic modernism vs. "deliberative democracy"**

Comprehensiveness vs. Incrementalism

- **Can "the public interest" be defined?**
- **What forces favor *incrementalism*? How should they be managed?**
- **Do contests among *interest groups* yield a public interest?**
- **Planners as advocates and decision-shapers vs. mediators, analysts, etc.**

The role of identity

- As a factor in *politics*
- As a factor reshaping *interventions* (norms, arrangements)
- As a target for *skill* building (competence)
- As a proxy for mistrust, barrier to *collective action*
- As a resource for *innovation*
- *Intersecting* identities (race/ethnicity, gender, class, religion, sexual preference, etc.)